

Architectural Design Review Board
Tuesday, April 19, 2016
4:31 p.m.

Planning Commission	At-Large		Council	Chamber of Commerce	Rossville
Tom Alf <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Steve Beckman	Armand Bloch <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Robert Brown <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Madam Chair Mary Pat Essman <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Pauline Fairbanks <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Joshua Smith				Rob Weigel	Jane Jacobs
SID	Dayton Lane	Architect	German Village	Historic Hamilton	
Larry Fiehrer <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Dan Graham <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Todd Palechek	Debbie Ripperger <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Karen Whalen <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	
Rick Demmel	Thomas O'Neill		Ann Brown	Shi O'Neill	

Staff: Mr. Ed Wilson, Ms. Heather Hodges, Ms. Kim Kirsch, Mr. John Creech, and Ms. Kathy Dudley.

Guests: Steve Packo, Mike Dingeldein, Ian MacKenzie-Thurley, Bill Wilks

The meeting was called to order by Madam Chair Essman at 4:31 pm.

I. Roll Call:

Mr. Alf, Mr. Bloch, Mr. Brown, Madam Chair Essman, Ms. Fairbanks, Mr. Fiehrer, Mr. Graham, Ms. Ripperger, and Ms. Whalen were present.

II. Swearing in of Those Providing Testimony to the Board:

Members of the audience wishing to speak were sworn in by Ms. Kathy Dudley, Assistant Law Director.

III. Approval of Meeting Minutes – Written Summary and Audio Recording for these dates:

- A. February 16, 2016 – Motion to accept by Mr. Brown, 2nd by Mr. Alf. With all “ayes”, except Mr. Bloch, Mr. Fiehrer, and Ms. Whalen (all abstained, not present at that meeting) the Motion passed and the minutes were approved.

IV. Properties Seeking COA - New Business

Agenda Item # 1- 407 North Third Street (German Village) – Rear Addition

Introduction:

The Applicant, Hamilton CORE Fund, has submitted a Certificate of Appropriateness Application for the property of 407 North Third Street. The proposal involves the construction of an addition at the rear of the structure.

The subject property of 407 North Third Street is part of the German Village Historic District and is Zoned “BPD” – Business Planned Development.

Background:

This is part of continued work for the property of 407 North Third Street. The property was reviewed and approved by the Architectural Design Review Board in the fall of 2015 for proposed painting.

State of Ohio Historic Designation:

The property of 407 North Third Street is not part of the State of Ohio Historic Inventory.

Proposal:

Construction of a new addition structure, attached to the rear of the existing structure of 407 North Third Street.

This is a two floor addition with a ground footprint area of 206.0878 Square Feet.

The addition extends from the existing rear of the structure 13' feet and 5 ½ inches and has a width matching the existing structure at 20 feet, 3 inches.

- Siding – Wood Siding to Match Existing
- Paint – Using Sherwin Williams Paints, Match the Existing Colors approved by the ADRB at the October 20, 2015 meeting.
 - Siding - SW 6146 “Umber”
 - Trim – SW 6140 “Moderate White”
- Roof – To Match the Existing of the Principal Structure.
 - The general Color is “Black”
- Windows – To Match the Existing
 - Per the Applicant, New Windows in Addition Only
- Gutters – To Match the Existing
- Soffit – To Match the Existing

The proposed plan for construction of the new addition was included in the Board packets as an Exhibit Attachment item.

Mr. Dingeldein was present and spoke to the Board. He said that the client interested in the house had a large family, and wanted an additional bedroom on the structure. He said that they are proposing to turn the current addition (which is located on to the back of the house – not part of the original structure) into a two story with the exact same footprint, using all the same finishes that the current house has.

There was a brief discussion between the Board members and Mr. Dingeldein involving the windows, stone walls in the front, and construction plans for the foundation.

Mr. Bloch made a Motion to close the Public Hearing. With a 2nd by Ms. Whalen and all “ayes”, the Public Hearing was closed.

Mr. Bloch made a Motion to approve the COA for construction as proposed. With a 2nd by Ms. Ripperger and all “ayes” by roll call vote, the Motion passes and the request is approved (9-0).

Mr. William Wilks came in after the meeting started, and Ms. Dudley swore him in.

Agenda Item # 2- 339 North Third Street (German Village) – Painting

Introduction:

The Applicant, William Wilks, has submitted a Certificate of Appropriateness Application for the property of 339 North Third Street. The proposal involves painting and exterior repairs (a maintenance item).

The subject property of 339 North Third Street is part of the German Village Historic District and is Zoned BPD – Business Planned Development.

Background:

The property at 339 North Third Street was cited by the Health Division for painting and exterior maintenance in January 2015. The deadline for correction was June 4, 2015.

State of Ohio Historic Designation:

This property of 339 North Third Street is not part of the State of Ohio Historic Inventory.

Proposal:

- Painting of the exterior of the building:
 - Shutters & Upper woodwork along roofline (very top, the framed box detail underneath and bottom line of the woodwork) – Proposed color is Black Magic (PPG1001-7)
 - Window Frames & Woodwork along roofline (underneath of the overhang around and inside the box detail) – Proposed color is Crepe (PPG1094-4)
 - Doors, Corbels & Flower Boxes – Proposed color is Baked Bean (PPG1066-7)

Mr. Wilson gave an overview of the application and proposals. Mr. Wilks was present for questions from the Board members.

Madam Chair Essman said that there are color swatches illustrated in the packets. Ms. Fairbanks asked Mr. Wilks if he had any actual samples of paint. She said that it has been her experience that the photocopies are not always the same. He said that he did not have actual paint samples, and Mr. Wilson made the offer that Staff has paint samples that they could provide for review.

Mr. Wilks spoke about the colors that he is proposing for the corbels and window frames and woodwork. Mr. Fiehrer and Mr. Wilks discussed the flower boxes, and Mr. Wilks said that the renter wanted to keep the flower boxes up and she

plans on planting flowers in them. It was discussed that if he wants to take them down in the future, that would require another COA.

Mr. Alf asked Mr. Wilks what type of business was going in at that location, and he said it was going to be a photography business.

Ms. Hodges returned to the meeting with paint color samples, and the Board reviewed the proposed colors.

Mr. Graham asked if the paint finish was going to be, and Mr. Wilks replied that he wasn't sure, but it wouldn't be glossy. Ms. Whalen asked Mr. Wilks what the "exterior repairs" are, and he replied that it's just general maintenance.

Mr. Graham made a Motion to close the public hearing. With a 2nd by Mr. Bloch and all "ayes", the public hearing was closed.

Mr. Brown made a Motion to approve the request as provided. With a 2nd by Ms. Ripperger and all "ayes" to roll call vote, the Motion passes and the request is approved (9-0).

Agenda Item # 3- 345 North Third Street (German Village) – Painting and Removal of Wooden Shakes

Introduction:

The Applicant, William Wilks, has submitted a Certificate of Appropriateness Application for the property of 345 North Third Street. The proposal involves painting and the removal of wood shake shingles.

The subject property of 345 North Third Street is part of the German Village Historic District and is Zoned BPD – Business Planned Development.

Background:

The property received a citation from the City of Hamilton Health Division for Exterior Maintenance including paint.

State of Ohio Historic Designation:

This property of 345 North Third Street is not part of the State of Ohio Historic Inventory.

Proposal:

- Removal of wood shake shingles and replace with wood shingle wrap. No further information provided by the applicant.
- Painting of the Exterior of the Building in Porter Paints (swatches supplied)
 - Golden Granola (PPG1094-5) – Shutters, Porch Columns, Accent Boards on the stucco portion of the building
 - Maple Syrup (PPG1084-7) – Windows (top and bottom detail), Wood Shingle wrap, Doors
 - Loofah (PPG1094-2) – Windows (interior and exterior frames) and Stucco

Mr. Wilson indicated to Madam Chair Essman that he contacted Mr. Craig Wilks, and verified what he was thinking as far as a sample of the wood shingle wrap, and there is no sample available of same. Mr. Bill Wilks said that the subject building is the last one to be done, and they are going to check with the new owner to see what he wants.

Madam Chair Essman asked Mr. Wilks if he wants the item to be tabled for now, and he said that he did. Madam Chair asked him what he wanted to do about the painting item, and he said that he wanted to wait on all of it. The item was withdrawn with approval by Mr. Wilks.

Agenda Item # 4- 401 North Third Street (German Village) – Painting

Introduction:

The Applicant, William Wilks, has submitted a Certificate of Appropriateness Application for the property of 401 North Third Street. The proposal involves painting of the property.

The subject property of 401 North Third Street is part of the German Village Historic District and is Zoned BPD – Business Planned Development.

Background:

This property received a citation from the Health Division in January 2015 for peeling paint.

State of Ohio Historic Designation:

This property of 401 North Third Street is not part of the State of Ohio Historic Inventory.

Proposal:

- Painting of the property in Porter Paints:
 - Bark (PPG1007-7) – Shutters, details of doors
 - Almond Cream (PPG1086-3) – Inside Window Frames, detail on the Wood Siding, Upper woodwork along roof (underneath the overhang)
 - Coffee With Cream (PPG1086-6) – Front Wood Siding, Upper Woodwork along the roof line (very top along the roofline)
 - Burled Redwood (PPG1067-7) – Window boxes, Corbels, Doors (with Bark PPG1007-7 detail), Upper Woodwork along the roof (accents)

Madam Chair Essman asked for Staff's paint samples to review the proposed colors. Mr. Wilks said that the brown is a deep brown, and Mr. Dingeldein said that the "Bark" is a slate gray.

Mr. Graham made a Motion to close the Public Hearing. With a 2nd by Mr. Bloch and all "ayes", the Public Hearing was closed.

Ms. Ripperger made a Motion to approve the request as provided. With a 2nd by Mr. Fiehrer and all "ayes" to a roll call vote, the Motion passed and the request was approved (9-0).

Agenda Item # 5- 311 Village Street (German Village) – Painting

Introduction:

The Applicant, William Wilks, has submitted a Certificate of Appropriateness Application for the property of 311 Village Street. The proposal involves painting of the property.

The subject property of 311 Village Street is part of the German Village Historic District and is Zoned BPD – Business Planned Development.

Background:

The property received a Health Division citation on June 23, 2015 for peeling paint and general exterior repairs.

State of Ohio Historic Designation:

This property of 311 Village Street is not part of the State of Ohio Historic Inventory.

Proposal:

- Painting of the property in Porter Paints as noted below:
 - Shebang (PPG1127-5) – Body of the building
 - Namaste (PPG1026-1) – Trim of the building
 - Drops of Honey (PPG1090-4) - Door

Mr. Wilks was still present for questions. His paint samples were passed to the Board for review.

Mr. Graham asked Mr. Wilks if the piece of plywood on the right hand side of the building near the air conditioner would be removed, and he indicated that it will. Mr. Brown asked Mr. Wilks about something that shows underneath the window by the front door (shadowbox or T-111 wood siding). Mr. Wilks didn't know the answer. Mr. Dingeldein replied that they were soffit jacks.

Mr. Graham made a Motion to close the Public Hearing. With a 2nd by Mr. Bloch and all "ayes", the Public Hearing was closed.

Mr. Graham made a Motion to approve the request as provided. With a 2nd by Ms. Ripperger and all "ayes" to a roll call vote, the Motion passed and the request was approved (9-0).

Agenda Item # 6- 21 South "C" Street (Rossville-Main Street) – Painting

Introduction:

The Applicant, Steve Packo, has submitted a Certificate of Appropriateness Application for the property of 21 South C Street. The proposal involves the painting of the structure.

The subject property of 21 South C Street is part of the Rossville-Main Street Historic District and is Zoned "MS-1", Main Street Core – Form Based Zoning District.

Background:

The Applicant has been in contact with the Planning Division, concerning work needed for 21 South C Street, and seeking the proper steps for COA compliance. This resulted in the submitted COA Application and proposal for ADRB review.

State of Ohio Historic Designation:

This property of 21 South C Street is part of the State of Ohio Historic Inventory, referenced as BUT-377-9.

Proposal:

Painting of the Building is proposed, utilizing multiple paint types and manufacturers.

- Sherwin Williams: SW 6149 “Relaxed Khaki” proposed for the Body of the house
 - (Also paint downspouts like the body of the house to hide them as well as any area they pass through.)
- Benjamin Moore, Historic Colors: HC-27 “Monterey White” proposed for the Trim around doors and windows
- Sherwin Williams: SW 6994 “Greenblack” proposed for the Doors
 - Sherwin Williams: SW 6215 “Rocky River”, glossy finish

Applicant notes that the selected color palette originated from Pam Mosser of Design Inspiration.

After a brief discussion between Mr. Packo and the Board, Mr. Graham made a Motion to close the Public Hearing. With a 2nd by Mr. Graham and all “ayes”, the Public Hearing was closed.

With no further discussion, Mr. Bloch made a Motion to approve the request as presented. With a 2nd by Mr. Brown and all ayes” to a roll call vote, the Motion passed and the request was approved (9-0).

Agenda Item # 7- 100 North “B” Street (State Historic Inventory) – Wood Front Porches, Metal Wrap of Cornices

Mr. Wilson advised that the Applicant, Mr. Wells, came in after Ms. Dudley had sworn in the audience members. Ms. Dudley went ahead and swore him in.

Introduction:

The Applicant, Daniel Wells, has submitted a Certificate of Appropriateness Application for the property of 100 North B Street. The proposal involves two items. First, the Applicant proposes building new wood decks with railing and pergolas for the entrances of the structure. Second, the Applicant proposes wrapping in metal the wood upper expression lines that define the top of the first floor and the profile of the top building.

The subject property of 100 North B Street is part of the State Historic Inventory and is Zoned "R-O", Multi-Family Residential – Office District.

Background:

In Late February 2016, the Applicant contacted the Community Development Department, Planning Division, due to a combination of Health Division Citation and the Planning Staff's efforts to inform the required State Historic Inventory property owners of the historic approval process and ADRB jurisdiction. In the conversation, the Applicant indicated the Health Citation, which per the Applicant, included the need to address the chipped paint areas and the cracked concrete.

The Applicant then relayed the proposed plans for the structure, which included wrapping the trim and the erection of wooden decks. The overall intention of the Applicant is to improve the property, but make it more maintenance-free. The Applicant indicated not wanting to have to paint the existing trim every 4 or 5 years, and expressed a disinclination for painting due to one of the sighted areas being 25 feet in the air. Staff answered the Applicant's questions, urged consideration of less intrusive solutions, and noted the need for a COA application and Architectural Design Review Board approval in order to begin the discussed work.

In April, the Applicant contacted the Planning Division once more, for clarification on what was needed to begin work. Once more, it was explained that a COA application was needed; the Applicant then visited the Planning Office in order to ask questions and submit an application. The proposal for 100 North B Street was the same as the previous conversation. This also included Staff sitting down with the Applicant to obtain some measure of samples via internet searches, for inclusion and attempted clarification of the proposal.

Staff did relay that such a proposal may have its difficulty due to the interruption of the existing historic material. Further, Staff again urged consideration of other more agreeable solutions such as painting the cited cornices. The Applicant still submitted the COA Application consisting of the current proposal for review, and again noted the need for work due to the Health Citation. Due to the proposal, the Staff relayed a physical copy of Preservation Brief #8 for thoroughness and for the Applicant's consideration. This was followed by an email to the Applicant of the ADRB Policies & Guidelines.

It appears that the front façade of the building is constructed adjacent (or very close to) to the front property/right-of-way line along North B Street. Therefore, any new construction would have to be reviewed and approved by City of Hamilton Public Works Department, because of the potential encroachment into the right-of-way.

State of Ohio Historic Designation:

This property of 100 North B Street is part of the State of Ohio Historic Inventory, referenced as BUT-372-9.

Proposal:

In summary, per the Applicant: Build new wood decks with railing & pergola, over the existing concrete ones in front of building. Wrap existing wood trim halfway up & soffit with metal trim, clay in color.

Wooden Decks

- Build New Wooden Decks, over the existing concrete steps for the entrances along North B Street.
- This includes Wood Railing and Pergolas for each of the porches.
- The new decks will be level with the entrances.
- Note Applicant did not select a color. Per the Applicant, the ADRB can decide the color of the proposed wooden decks.
 - Applicant selected example through staff-applicant meeting has been provided as an Exhibit Attachment item.

Wrap Cornice in Metal

- “Clay” in color
 - Per the Applicant, the existing color is undesirable, hence the proposed clay color.
- Per the Applicant, the metal will be wrapped to follow the shape of the existing cornice and soffit
 - Applicant selected example through staff-applicant meeting has been provided as an Exhibit Attachment item.

Madam Chair Essman opened up the discussion between the Board and Mr. Wells regarding his plans for the “wooden decks” first. There was then a brief discussion between the Board and Mr. Wells regarding what his intent was for the decks, railing, and pergolas. In that conversation, Mr. Wells stated that when he bought the building through foreclosure, he wasn’t told that it was historic and that had he not received our letter, the work would have already been done. He said that he wants to improve it, but it needs to be “budget friendly” for him also.

There was then a very brief discussion between Madam Chair Essman, Mr. Wilson, Mr. Fiehrer, and Mr. Wells regarding the placement of the steps with

regard to the encroachment on the sidewalk. They also discussed what he intends to do with the wooden steps, what types of material he intends on using for the renovations, and the pergolas.

Upon a request by Mr. Graham, Mr. Wilson brought up the State of Ohio Inventory Record and enlarged it in order to get information off of it with regard to the original porch and placement of same. They also looked at several pictures from the 1970's and discussed the renovations and alterations that have occurred since then.

The Board then discussed several other options with Mr. Wells, commended him for investing in the property, and said that it has great potential. Once the discussion with Mr. Wells concluded, Mr. Bloch made a Motion to Close the Public Hearing. With a 2nd by Ms. Ripperger and all "ayes", the Public Hearing was closed.

Mr. Brown said that he would like to see drawings depicting the proposals from the Applicant, including materials for the top and sides, and Ms. Whalen agreed with him and expounded on that a bit. Mr. Alf, Ms. Fairbanks and Mr. Bloch then gave their suggestions and opinions of options for the Applicant.

Ms. Dudley advised that if the Applicant is willing to waive the 30 day requirement, the Applicant could amend his application and it could be put on a later date. He replied that he is under a time crunch due to the City "breathing down his neck" and sending him nasty letters. Madam Chair Essman indicated to him that it would just be 2 weeks, and the Applicant was agreeable to bringing back a rendering of what he is proposing.

Mr. Brown made a Motion to Table the Application pending an amended application depicting the materials to be used, the colors of the paint (or stain) to be used, and a drawing over one of the porches. Ms. Fairbanks suggested that Mr. Wilson could help the Applicant if he needed it in obtaining the necessary information for the Amended Application.

With a 2nd by Ms. Whalen and all "ayes", the Motion is passed and the application is tabled.

With regard to the cornices, the Applicant explained his proposal for those. Ms. Fairbanks conveyed that the Board does not want aluminum or vinyl. The Applicant said that the cost for painting would be very expensive. Mr. Wells expressed his frustration at the guidelines that he's being held to for a house that he didn't know was historic when he bought it. Mr. Bloch made a suggestion of a one-time application of a product known as "RhinoShield", and gave the benefits of using such a product. Mr. Wells again said that he's under a time constraint and has a court date from the City of Hamilton, so he has to get something done

quickly. There was then a bit of conversation between Mr. Wells and the Board regarding what he's actually been cited for with regard to the building, his timeline for getting the items done in order to be compliant with the Health Department, and the current color and condition of the structure.

Ms. Fairbanks told Mr. Wells about the "Building Doctor", and said that it might offer him some helpful information as the owner of a historic building. Mr. Graham asked Mr. Wells if he was provided with reference material for vinyl siding by Mr. Wilson, and he said that he was. Mr. Graham asked Mr. Wells if he had reviewed the information that he was provided, and he said that he had. Mr. Graham had no further questions for the Applicant.

Mr. Bloch made a Motion to close the public hearing. With a 2nd by Mr. Graham and all "ayes", the motion passes and the public hearing is closed.

Ms. Whalen said that she likes Mr. Bloch's idea of "Rhinoshield", and that she believes that it will maintain the character of the building. Mr. Graham said that he has used it and is very happy with it. Mr. Graham said that he is completely opposed to the wrapping of the "dental work" with aluminum. He then cited several different sections of the ADRB Policies and Procedures. He told Mr. Wells that he is very sympathetic to him with regard to the cost, but he doesn't think it's appropriate to cover the detail at the top of the building. He then went on to say that with based on the photo that is attached with the State of Ohio Historic record, he doesn't think that the ledger board with the dental molding between the first and second floor is original to the structure. There was a brief discussion between Ms. Whalen, Madam Chair Essman, and Ms. Ripperger regarding if there was a board that was attached to the fire escape, and how it was attached to the building. Mr. Fiehrer asked Mr. Wilson to bring a depiction of the house back up, and the Board discussed the current features. After a bit more discussion, Ms. Fairbanks made a Motion to deny the COA. With a 2nd by Mr. Fiehrer and a roll call vote of 8-0 (and one abstain by Mr. Alf), the Motion was passed and the COA was denied. The Applicant expressed frustration at the decision, and Madam Chair Essman suggested that he work with Mr. Wilson to try to come up with a solution that the Board will approve.

Ms. Ripperger said that she understands his position, but if everyone did what they wanted to the historic properties and didn't adhere to the guidelines, there would be no more historic homes.

Mr. Alf said that he thinks that the Board needs to work with the applicant to come up with a solution that is agreeable for both instead of ending up with an empty lot.

V. Miscellaneous/Discussion/On the Radar

Madam Chair Essman confirmed where and when Building Doctor starts. Mr. Wilson went over several other items of interest:

Property Inquiries:

200 Hancock Avenue – Like-for-Like COA
350 North Third Street – Like-for-Like COA

Mr. Wilson then advised that Streetspark would like to address the Board with regard to 244 Main Street, and Madam Chair Essman said that would be fine.

Mr. Ian MacKenzie-Thurley spoke. He said that the item went to the BZA and they upheld the appeal with a ruling of 3-1. He said that they are withdrawing the mural request for 244 Main, and they would like to sit down with the ADRB to go over their role and their intentions. He said that they would like to bring the artist here from North Carolina that came up with the mural.

Madam Chair Essman said told she appreciates him coming forward. She asked him what StreetSpark is looking for from the Board, and he answered that.

Madam Chair Essman and Ms. Dudley had a brief conversation about the procedure for a “working session” and whether or not it had to be a public meeting. Mr. MacKenzie-Thurley then gave a bit more information on what they are hoping to achieve from the meeting.

Mr. Wilson asked all Board members to make sure that the information on the contact sheet that is being passed around is accurate and up to date.

VI. Adjourn

Mr. Graham made a Motion to Adjourn. With a 2nd by Mr. Bloch, the meeting was adjourned.

Submitted by:

Chair:


Ed Wilson
Secretary, ADRB


Mary Pat Essman
Madam Chair, ADRB

